



MINUTES OF THE WORKING COMMITTEE

Topic I – “Strengthening Integrated Deterrence: Air, Land, Sea, Space and Cyberspace.”

At 09:57 a.m. on July 27, 2022, within the 2021-2022 Cycle of the XV Conference of Defense Ministers of the Americas, chaired by the Ministry of Defense of Brazil, the work on Topic II - " Strengthening Integrated Deterrence: Air, Land, Sea, Space and Cyberspace." began, with Brazil as rapporteur country and Canada as moderating country.

I - BACKGROUND

A. The Conference of Defense Ministers of the Americas (CMDA) is a biennial meeting of multilateral policy and international importance, integrated and directed by the Defense Ministers of the Americas, with the approval of the governments of their respective countries. It is the main meeting place for the defense sector in the hemisphere and, according to article 2 of its regulations, its fundamental purpose is to promote reciprocal knowledge, analysis, debate and exchange of ideas and experiences in the field of Defense and Security.

B. At the XV CMDA Preparatory Meeting, which took place on March 31, 2022, by videoconference, Theme I - " Strengthening Integrated Deterrence: Air, Land, Sea, Space and Cyberspace." was approved for discussion during the Conference.

II – PARTICIPATING DELEGATIONS

Board of Directors:

1. Rapporteur: Lieutenant-Colonel Michael A. Grygar, Chief of Staff, United States Secretary of Defense.
2. Assistant Rapporteur: Mr. Guilherme Lopes da Cunha, Professor Doctor of the Brazilian War College.
3. Moderator: Sea and War Captain Carlos Antonio Raposo de Vasconcellos, Adjunct of the Political Affairs Division of the Brazilian War College.

Pro Tempore Secretariat Representatives of the XV CMDA

4. Rear Admiral Antonio Cesar da Rocha Martins, Executive secretary of the XV CMDA.
5. José Rubens Marques, Colonel, XV CMDA Executive Secretary Coordinator.



Participating Country Delegations

Argentina

6. Carlos Gabriel Funes, Naval Attaché in Brazil.

Bahamas

7. LT Colonel Clinton D. Johnson, Cyber and Drone Officer.

Brasil

8. Colonel José Rubens Marques, Delegate of Brazil.

Chile

9. Ms. Karen Meier, Chief of International Affairs of the Undersecretariat of Defense, Ministry of Defense of Chile.

Colombia

10. Colonel Jesus Antonio Martinez Moreno, Colombian Aeronautical Attaché in Brazil.

Ecuador

11. Colonel Octavio Rosales Hidalgo, Defense Attaché of Ecuador.

United States

12. Paul Joseph Angelo, CHDS director.

Mexico

13. Myr. DEM Inf. Arnulfo Espinoza Perez, Delegate of Mexico.

Peru

14. Miguel Angel Peña Castro, Peru's Delegate.

Uruguay

15. Air General Rodolfo Pereyra Martínez, Chief of the Defense Staff of Uruguay.

III – EVENT DEVELOPMENT

C. The Working Committee established the following objective: To generate a dialogue space for the presentation and debates on Theme I - "Strengthening Integrated Deterrence: Air, Land, Sea, Space and Cyberspace." and the subsequent presentation of the conclusions and recommendations resulting from the work in the plenary session of the Conference for ratification and rectification by the Heads of Delegation.

D. The Working Committee observed the General Principles of CDMA, established in Article 3 of its regulations, namely:

1. Scope of action;



2. Flexibility in attendance;
3. Acceptance of diversity;
4. Abstention to the pursuit of the creation of doctrines;
5. Permanent interaction;
6. Projection; and
7. Increased bilateral contact.

IV - SESSIONS

Block 1 – Reading of the opening text and objectives of the committee's work by the rapporteur.

1. The moderator opened the WG. He then made a presentation on the theme and offered a text to stimulate debate. The delegations manifested themselves.
2. Peru suggested that the text be sent to the Extraordinary Meeting on the Brasilia Declaration, before being discussed.
3. Brazil referred to the principles and foundations that guide the CDMA, mentioning that no doctrine or troop movement can be agreed upon.
4. The rapporteur proposed that we need to cooperate, sharing information in all domains, to deal with threats that we share.
5. Ecuador asked about which organization will operationalize the proposal regarding the topic.
6. The rapporteur asserts that the idea is not to form a new structure. It is not a new organization, but a suggestion to integrate, coordinate and cooperate in all domains.
7. Chile expresses that it is important to have other countries present so that we are in a better position to make more concrete decisions.
8. Brazil states that the low quorum does not prevent us from moving the issue forward.
9. Uruguay states that we cannot identify the threats of each member, but that something common to all can be proposed.
10. The rapporteur says that we must combine efforts.
11. Colombia suggests studying what the new threats are.



Block 2

1. The moderator clarifies that the text presented by the rapporteur contributes to the debates.
2. The Rapporteur informs that the text intends to present a beginning for further studies.
3. Chile manifested that the concept is incompatible with its legal system and suggests that the countries agree on further analysis of the subject.
4. Argentina suggests that the topic can be studied in the next two (2) years, when the opinion of more countries can be obtained, considering the ten (10) delegates present.
5. The moderator identifies that the idea of studying the theme needs to continue.
6. Brazil agrees to elaborate on the theme, which still leaves doubts, as it is still incipient.
7. Mexico expresses that the issue is not sufficiently developed and that it is not possible for its delegation to identify and establish compatibility with the principles of its foreign policy, hence the need for further analysis.
8. Colombia presents the possibility of submitting the proposed topic to the IADB-IDC for academic support. It proposes more studies and knowledge on the subject.
9. Ecuador emphasizes that transnational threats affect the sovereignty of states and suggests that the topic be studied in the OAS.
10. The moderator identifies that most members are in agreement that the topic needs to continue to be discussed.
11. Argentina identifies that Argentina's legal framework needs more information in order to move forward on this issue.
12. Uruguay stresses that the topic is broad and complex, making it difficult for members to find the same opinion and proposes a prior academic analysis.
13. Brazil affirms that the IADB is not subordinated to the CDMA, and that it is necessary to request authorization from the OAS to carry out studies.
14. Uruguay proposes that there should be an academic work that ratifies definitions and propositions about the path to follow and suggests that it be done by the IADB.
15. The Bahamas identifies that a better understanding of the object of deterrence is needed.

V - CONCLUSIONS OF THE WORKING COMMITTEE

- E. The Working Committee debated on various issues and shared perspectives on Theme I “Strengthening Integrated Deterrence: Air, Land, Sea, Space and Cyberspace.”
- The importance and relevance of the topic was recognized;
 - Because of its complexity, delegates concluded that the topic needs to be further studied; and



XV Conference of Defense Ministers of the Americas

Brasília-DF, Brazil July 25-29, 2022



➤ The participating countries are grateful for the willingness of the United States Rapporteur to carefully conduct the exposition of the topic, and to all who contributed to the success of this Working Committee.

VI - RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE WORKING COMMISSION TO THE DEFENSE AND SECURITY MINISTERS

- F. Recognizing the specificities of each country on the subject, the Working Committee recommends the following:
1. Unanimously, the members present suggest that the subject be submitted to the OAS for a more detailed study of the proposal through the IADB and that it be taken up at the XVI CDMA.
- G. At 5:30 p.m. on July 27, 2022, the Working Committee on Topic - I: "Strengthening Integrated Deterrence: Air, Land, Sea, Space and Cyberspace"; closed its activities with the signing of these Minutes.
- H. It is noted that the Executive Secretariat of the XV CMDA will distribute digital copies of this document to the Member States in the official languages of the CDMA
- I. These minutes are signed by the representatives of the Executive Secretariat of the XV CMDA and by the representatives of the Member State Delegations of CMDA who participated in this Working Committee: